From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Sent: Wednesday, 16 July 2025 12:45 PM

To: s 47F ; s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au; s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Subject: RE: Minister meeting with YouTube [SEC=OFFICIAL]

### **OFFICIAL**

Good afternoon **S 47F** 

Thanks for your follow up email. Please see Webex link below for the meeting next Tuesday. Please diarise at your end.

Don't hesitate to reach out if you have any questions.

-- Do not delete or change any of the following text. --

When it's time, join your Webex meeting here.

## Join meeting

## More ways to join:

#### Join from the meeting link

https://ditrdca.webex.coms 22(1)(a)(ii)

### Join by meeting number

Meeting number (access code): s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Meeting password: s 22(1)(a)(ii) when dialing from a video system)

## Tap to join from a mobile device (attendees only)

s 22(1)(a)(ii) ## Australia Toll

## Join by phone

s 22(1)(a)(ii) Australia Toll

Global call-in numbers

## Join from a video system or application

Dial s 22(1)(a)(ii) @ditrdca.webex.com

You can also dial s 22(1)(a)(ii) and enter your meeting number.

If you are a host, click here and login site to view host information.

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Executive Assistant • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP

Minister for Communications • Minister for Sport • Member for Lilley

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au • s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Suite M1.19, Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts

CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS • ENRICHING COMMUNITIES • EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au



I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live. I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

#### **OFFICIAL**

From: \$ 47F @google.com>

Sent: Tuesday, 15 July 2025 7:35 PM

To: 5 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Cc: **S 22(1)(a)(ii)** @aph.gov.au; B**S 22(1)(a)(ii)** @mo.communications.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Minister meeting with YouTube [SEC=OFFICIAL]

You don't often get email from \$ 47F@google.com. Learn why this is important

Hi \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) just following up for a meeting invite and webex link.

Cheers,



: 47F

YouTube Government Affairs and Public Policy -Australia and New Zealand

s 47F

s 47F@google.com

On Fri, Jul 4, 2025 at 10:53 AM S 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

Thanks 5 47F - see you then.

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Senior Adviser • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP • Minister for Communications and Minister for Sport

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au

M s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS • ENRICHING COMMUNITIES • EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au



I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live.

 $I\ recognise\ and\ respect\ their\ continuing\ connection\ to\ the\ land,\ waters\ and\ communities.$ 

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

### **OFFICIAL**

From: \$ 47F @google.com>
Sent: Thursday, 3 July 2025 10:57 PM

Fo: 5 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Cc: \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au; \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Minister meeting with YouTube [SEC=OFFICIAL]

Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Thanks for your patience while I confirmed \$47F's availability.

We'd be grateful if we could please lock in a meeting at 2:00pm on 22 July.

Cheers,

s 47F



YouTube Government Affairs and Public Policy -Australia and New Zealand

s 47F@google.com

On Tue, Jul 1, 2025 at 1:55 PM s 22(1)(a)(ii)

@mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

His 47F

Not a problem - the Minister could meet at 10.00am on 24 July or 2.00pm on 22 July. Please let me know if either of these times work.

Kind Regards,

## s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Senior Adviser • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP • Minister for Communications and Minister for Sport

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au

M s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS . ENRICHING COMMUNITIES . EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au







I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live.

I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

#### **OFFICIAL**

**From: s 47F** @google.com> Sent: Monday, 30 June 2025 11:05 PM

@mo.communications.gov.au>

2(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au; s 22(1)(a)(ii) p@mo.communications.gov.au>

**Subject:** Re: Minister meeting with YouTube [SEC=OFFICIAL]

## - s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Thanks again for working with us to find a mutually convenient time for the Minister to meet with us to discuss the eSafety Commissioner's advice prior to making any final decision.

Given the significant impact of this decision on our users and creators, and the consequent importance we place on this issue, our senior most executive would like to take the meeting with the Minister. Unfortunately, despite my best efforts, we are struggling to find a time that works prior to the Minister's planned leave.

In these circumstances, would it be possible to find a time after the Minister returns from leave? Could you let us know some other dates that might work?

Cheers,





YouTube Government Affairs and Public Policy -Australia and New Zealand



@google.com

On Sun, Jun 29, 2025 at 9:16 AM s 22(1)(a)(ii)



@mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

Hi **s 47F** 

The Minister is going on leave from 5 July. Do you have any other availability next week?

Thanks,



From: \$ 47F @google.com>
Date: Friday, 27 June 2025 at 11:32:27 pm

To: \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Cc: "S 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au" <S 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au>, "S 22(1)(a)(ii) "

<s 22(1)(a)(ii)@mo.communications.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Minister meeting with YouTube [SEC=OFFICIAL]

Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Unfortunately we can't make that time work. Does the Minister have availability in the morning of Tuesday 8 July?

Cheers,





s 47F

YouTube Government Affairs and Public Policy -Australia and New Zealand

s 47F

s 47F@google.com

On Tue, Jun 24, 2025 at 5:55 PM **5** 47F @google.com> wrote:

Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Thanks for your email. Let me check on availability on our side. I will come back to you.

Cheers,





s 47F

YouTube Government Affairs and Public Policy -Australia and New Zealand



s 47F@google.com

On Tue, Jun 24, 2025 at 4:54 PM **S 22(1)(a)(ii)** 

@mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

His 47F

Thanks for speaking earlier. The Minister is available to meet with YouTube on 3 July at 9.00am AEST. Please let me know if that works.

Kind Regards,

## s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Senior Adviser • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP • Minister for Communications and Minister for Sport

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au

м s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS . ENRICHING COMMUNITIES . EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au





I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.
I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.
OFFICIAL
Disclaimer
This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.  Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in several penalties.  If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on \$22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copies of this transmission together with any attachments.
Disclaimer
This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.  Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe
oenalties.  f you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on s 22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copie of this transmission together with any attachments.
isclaimer
his message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, ommunications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may ontain confidential and/or legally privileged material.
ny review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, his information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe enalties.
you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on \$\frac{s}{22(1)(a)(ii)}\$ and delete all copies f this transmission together with any attachments.
· <del></del>
 sclaimer

I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live.

This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.

Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe penalties.

If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on s 22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copies of this transmission together with any attachments.

\_\_\_\_\_



## **OFFICIAL**

From: s 47F

**Sent:** Monday, 21 July 2025 5:42 PM

To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au; s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Subject: YouTube Backgrounder and Response to eSafety Advice

Dear Barnaby and \$ 22(1)(a)(ii)

Please find attached a document that provides an overview of our platform and our response to the eSafety Commissioner's advice.

Cheers,



s 22(1)(a)(ii)

YouTube Government Affairs and Public Policy - Australia and New Zealand

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

@google.com



The purpose of this document is to correct misunderstandings - and misrepresentations - about our platform, how it works and is used, so that the Government understands why it thought it was necessary to give an exemption to YouTube under the rules of the Social Media Minimum Age Act (SMMA), and why it should maintain that position. We also provide a response to the eSafety Commissioner's advice.

## 1. YouTube is a video sharing platform (not social media)

## 1.1. YouTube makes available video content across multiple formats and is accessible on web, mobile and tv.

YouTube is an advertiser supported video sharing platform where kids, adults and families come to find and consume high quality video content. We offer that content across multiple formats. YouTube hosts <u>both</u> long and short form video, as well as livestream and podcasts. As the Government's own Discussion Paper accompanying the Draft Rules noted:

'[t]his contrasts substantially with other content streaming services, which are predominantly used by young people to view short-form entertainment content.'

This difference is important. It goes directly to how YouTube is used or valued by Australian users. It is for this reason that YouTube is where Australians come to find high quality <a href="news">news</a>, <a href="mailto:muses">music</a>, <a href="mailto:sports">sports</a> and <a href="mailto:learning">learning</a> content. YouTube is where the <a href="mailto:Federal Court of Australia">Federal Court of Australia</a> provides Australians with open access to justice through live streamed hearings. It is where the <a href="mailto:Australian Parliament">Australian Parliament</a> shares parliamentary proceedings using short form, long form and live stream. It is where you can watch episodes of TV shows, including old replays of Australian programs, or sing with The Wiggles. It is more than just cat videos. It is more than just low quality user-generated uploads.

The difference in content types and formats is also reflected in the different ways that users access YouTube. The use of connected TV to access YouTube in particular reflects a difference in content types and use cases between YouTube and social media platforms. Views on connected TVs have increased more than **130% in the last 3 years** and in Australia, connected TV is YouTube's fastest growing screen for the past five years (as over 2024). In Australia, over 65% YouTube connected TV watch time is on content that is 21 min or longer.

# 1.2. Unlike social media, YouTube does not encourage users to build and actively engage with their social network

Social media services focus on facilitating two-way social relationships between users and encourage users to build and actively engage with their social network within the platform. Users go to social media platforms to connect to other end-users, usually within an identified social circle (e.g. friends, relatives, colleagues, classmates or communities).

In contrast, YouTube focuses on hosting video content for audiences to select and view, and enabling those who create the content to monetise it. The form of engagement on YouTube is centred on discovering and

consuming video content of interest to them as distinct from being used to socially interact with other users.

Even where YouTube has some features similar to those of social media services, like comments for example, these are not aimed towards social networking and are ancillary to YouTube's core functions. For example, YouTube's comments section does not facilitate ongoing dialogue or social relationships between users. It appears "below the fold" of the YouTube Watch page, the focus of which remains the video player. In contrast, the comments or reply function is key for many social media platforms

Further, these features alone, are also not determinative of being characterised as a Social Media Service. For example:

- Auto-play has long been used in traditional television programming and across subscription and broadcast video on demand services.
- Qualitative social metrics (comment, like or subscribe) are used across news apps, ecommerce services and review sites.
- Short form video is ubiquitous online including across nearly all of Australia's major newspapers websites.
- Recommendations are used broadly across digital services including streaming services,
   ecommerce platforms, online delivery services, educational platforms, news apps, and more.

## 1.3. Others agree that YouTube is different to social media.

That YouTube has a different purpose - and is used differently by Australians to other social media services - is supported and recognised by others:

According to 2024 research by Oxford Economics:

91% users report using YouTube to "gather information and knowledge".

According to 2025 published by <u>Nature</u>:

Across generations, we found that Australians see YouTube as a platform for learning, creativity, and entertainment, while TikTok is associated with social media addiction and inappropriate content...They see [YouTube] as the antithesis to the doom scroll, with content that entertains, inspires and educates—distinct from the addictive nature of other social platforms...This suggests that keeping it accessible to young people is a sound decision.

• Jonathan Haidt, the Anxious Generation, concludes:

"YouTube is more widely used as the world's video library than for its social features"

• The ACCC found that YouTube is 'significantly differentiated' to social media services as it 'lack(s) features designed to facilitate social connections' and is 'used by users differently (for example, YouTube is often accessed through connected TV)'1.

In fact, it was the difference between YouTube and other social media services that was the reason why the Government decided to exempt YouTube.

As the Discussion Paper to the Exposure draft *Online Safety (Age Restricted Social Media Platforms) Rules 2025* (Draft Rules) stated:

Based on research undertaken by the eSafety Commissioner, YouTube has consistently ranked as one of the top digital services used by children and young people in Australia. While the platform undoubtedly functions as a source of entertainment and leisure, it is an important source of education and informational content, relied on by children, parents and carers, and educational institutions. This contrasts substantially with other content streaming services, which are predominantly used by young people to view short-form entertainment content.. On this basis, the proposed Online Safety Rules exclude YouTube from the minimum age obligation.

## 2. YouTube is for families

## 2.1. Families value YouTube because it offers high quality content that supports learning growth and development of Australian kids and teens

Because of its range of content, format and accessibility, YouTube is where Australian kids and teens come to be **informed and to learn.** 

YouTube's breadth of content provides younger users with access to information that supports their engagement, growth, development and wellbeing. As a recent segment from the ABC's <u>Behind the News</u> – a children's news and current affairs program made available on YouTube – showed Australian kids are using YouTube to watch videos on 'fishing, spearfishing and water activities' and 'crochet content'. It is also why YouTube is where Australian families turn for free access to high quality entertainment for their kids. This includes videos from Australian kids content creators like <u>The Wiggles</u>, <u>Bounce Patrol</u>, <u>Mik Maks</u>, <u>Lah-Lah</u> and <u>ABC Kids</u>.

And Australian parents agree, with 2024 research by Oxford Economics, finding that:

- 79% of parents who use YouTube agree that YouTube (or YouTube Kids) provides quality content for their children's learning and/or entertainment.
- 72% of Australian parents who use YouTube agree that YouTube (or YouTube Kids) helps their children learn.

So do Australian teachers. An August 2024 Ipsos study found that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> ACCC Digital platforms services inquiry: Interim report 6: Report on social media services, March 2023, p.11

- 84% of teachers surveyed in Australia say YouTube helps students to continue to learn outside of the classroom
- 82% of teachers surveyed in Australia say learning-related content on YouTube helps students spend their online time in a positive way.
- 84% of teachers surveyed in Australia use YouTube on at least a monthly basis to help their students learn
- 85% of teachers surveyed in Australia say YouTube has the right kind of content to complement traditional lesson plans
- 82% of teachers surveyed in Australia would recommend YouTube to students to support their learning.

This value was also recognised by the Australian Government at the time the SMMA was being considered - by the <u>Prime Minister</u> and the <u>then-Communications Minister</u>. And was even recognised by the Australian Parliament, which supported the passage of the SMMA on the <u>understanding</u> that YouTube would be exempted, with no recommendations to the contrary from the <u>Senate Environment and Communications</u> <u>Legislation Committee</u> inquiry into the SMMA.

In fact, this conclusion is supported by the Government's own <u>consumer research</u> which found broad agreement that YouTube was suitable for younger users, with 85% of children and 68% of parents indicating it was appropriate for those aged 15 years and under. This was in contrast to TikTok, Snapchat, Instagram, Facebook and Facebook Messenger which were considered suitable for slightly older age groups.

Closely related to the quality of content on YouTube are the creators that make it. YouTube plays an important role in Australia's creative ecosystem. Children's content creators, for example, use YouTube to reach their audience directly, without the need to be chosen or commissioned for a service, and through our industry-leading revenue sharing program, they can build sustainable careers and continue to create content that inspires, educates and entertains.

This includes younger Australian creators and artists who also use our platform to develop skills, find audiences, build sustainable careers and export local content globally. YouTube is where a number of **successful Australians creatives began their careers** - by creating accounts, they were able to share their talent and skills with Australia and the world.

- artist Troye Sivan, who 'got started' on YouTube as a teenager.
- filmmaker <u>Michael Shanks</u>, who started out making videos for his YouTube channel as a teenager
  and has just sold rights to his first feature film in 'one of the richest deals in the history of the
  Sundance Film Festival'.
- the <u>Philippou brothers</u>, who channelled early skills honed on YouTube into the feature film *Talk to Me* that premiered at Sundance and won best film and best direction at the 2024 Australian Academy of Cinema and Television Arts Awards (AACTA).

## 2.2. YouTube sets a high baseline of safety for all users - and applies additional interventions and protections for younger account holders

YouTube's mission is to give everyone a voice and show them the world - and openness and free expression are at the heart of this. Our platform is a place where a broad range of perspectives are encouraged, and we don't shy away from disagreement and debate.

That said, we still recognise that not all content is permissible, and that not all content is appropriate for younger audiences.

This means we do not take a one-size-fits all approach and we build products that are flexible and meet the developmental stages of children as they grow. What works for a child 0 - 12 should not necessarily be copied and pasted for teens that are 13-17 years old. And what works for one family may not be what others want for theirs. We believe every child and every family are different, but all children deserve to be able to access and use services in ways that respect their unique vulnerabilities and protect them from harm and abuse.

We achieve this by:

 Ensuring a high baseline of safety for all users we set a high baseline of safety through our Community Guidelines, our policies that outline what is and is not allowed on YouTube for all users.

These policies prohibit content for all users across a number of verticals, including pornography, cyberbullying, suicide and self harm, and other content that endangers the emotional and physical safety of minors. Our Community Guidelines and content protections apply across all types of content, including comments and YouTube Shorts. For content that does not violate our policies, but is not suitable for viewers under 18, we apply age restrictions. Content that is age-restricted is not capable of being viewed, nor recommended to either account holders that are under 18 or to logged-out users.

 Using our recommendation system to <u>mitigate and reduce exposure to harmful content</u>, not amplify.

We do this by raising up high-quality information from authoritative sources in ranking and recommendations and by providing context, and by reducing recommendations of borderline content (content that doesn't violate our policies, but may still misinform users in harmful ways, for example conspiracy theory videos),.

For topics where accuracy and high quality are key — like news, personal finance and medical and scientific information — we elevate high-quality voices using a variety of tools such as the <a href="Mealth content shelf">Breaking News shelf</a> and <a href="health content shelf">health content shelf</a>. To provide additional context about certain events, topics and publishers, we use information panels across YouTube.

For younger users our recommendations system plays an important role in how we maintain a responsible and enriching platform for younger users. It helps to connect them to high-quality content - informed by quality principles developed in collaboration with independent child development and digital wellbeing experts - that inspires curiosity, imagination, and creativity. It also minimizes the chances they'll see low quality content.

## Applying additional and targeted interventions at the account level for younger users to enable age-appropriate experiences

We have a three-pronged approach when it comes to children and families:

- We build age-appropriate products that align with kids' and teens' developmental stages and needs, including YouTube Kids and supervised experiences;
- We offer a number of settings and tools that give families flexibility to manage their unique relationships with technology; and
- We implement policies, protections, and programs that help keep every kid and teen safer online.

YouTube doesn't take a one-size-fits all approach. What works for children 0 - 12 shouldn't necessarily be copied and pasted for teens that are 13-17 years old. And what works for one family may not be what others want for theirs. This means we treat kids as kids, teens like teens, and adults like adults.

YouTube applies **additional interventions at the account level for kids under the age of 18**. These inventions, developed over a number of years with third party experts, are designed to create a safer, more age-appropriate experience for teens and tweens on YouTube - see **Attachment A**.

While YouTube's logged out user experience sets a robust baseline of safety responsive to a signed out user state, with participation features disabled (upload, comment, like, subscribe) and access to age-restricted content blocked, many of these same protections also apply to u18 accounts.

What YouTube's inclusion under the SMMA would mean is that **Australians under 16 are forced** into a logged out state and denied additional, age appropriate interventions designed to provide a safer experience.

This outcome is nonsensical and runs counter to the purpose and intention of the SMMA.

## 3. Response to the eSafety Commissioner's advice

The eSafety Commissioner's advice to the Minister recommends against YouTube's exemption on the following grounds:

- The alleged risk of harm on YouTube.
- The alleged similarity of its functions to other online services
- Alleged insufficient evidence that it provides beneficial experiences for children under 16.

The following responds to the arguments raised by the eSafety Commissioner to support this conclusion.

## 3.1. Alleged risk of harm on YouTube

The alleged harms identified by the eSafety Commissioner appear to be based primarily on an eSafety recent Youth Survey that indicated that:

- YouTube was said to be the most popular platform children had ever used with 76% of 10 to 15
  year olds having used YouTube in their lifetime; and
- Among a subset of children who had ever seen or heard potentially harmful content, 37% reported their most recent or impactful experience occurred on YouTube and of a similar subset 21% reported their most recent or impactful experience of seeing online hate occurred on YouTube.

In response, we note the following:

#### • That YouTube is popular amongst Australian youth is not evidence of harm.

YouTube's popularity confirms only that it is widely used but does not mean that YouTube is harmful. Wide usage could simply suggest that parents and children alike find value and have trust in our platform.

The Government's own <u>consumer research</u> supports this conclusion. It found broad agreement that YouTube was suitable for younger users, with 85% of children and 68% of parents indicating it was appropriate for those aged 15 years and under. This was in contrast to TikTok, Snapchat, Instagram, Facebook and Facebook Messenger which were considered suitable for slightly older age groups.

#### "Harmful Content" is vaguely defined.

The eSafety Commissioner used categories of 'harmful content' as a measure. These categories included: "shows or encourages illegal drug taking", "extreme real-life violence" or "something else upsetting". The categories, which could capture content that while upsetting may not necessarily be of the type of content that should be restricted. In fact this content is readily available across TV, movies, streaming platforms, and others. For example - "extreme life violence" or "something else upsetting" could capture news reporting or content that "shows or encourages illegal drug taking" could capture clips from mainstream movies, TV or even popular music.

How children were accessing that content is also relevant but not reflected in the survey. For example, use of a parents account would mean that content controls (such as age restriction or parental controls) would not be in place.

Finally the survey is limited only to content that a user may have encountered on a select group of digital platforms or messaging services - it does not compare whether that risk is any higher than the risk of a user aged 10 - 15 accessing that content from other sources - for example, content accessed elsewhere on the internet (news or other websites that may contain age inappropriate content that is accessible from a home device or parent account), broadcast TV or video-streaming services.

 The eSafety Commissioner fails to consider those harms that the same survey shows are more prevalent on social media and messaging services, thus distinguishing the service and the harms the SMMA is intending to address.

The survey reports the % of children surveyed who themselves experienced online sexual harassment, grooming type behaviour and non-consensual tracking, monitoring and harassment across specific products. For those harms YouTube consistently scored much lower than social media services - for example, for "online sexual harassment" the survey reported that 14% of users who used Instagram experienced online sexual harassment whereas only 3% of users experienced the same type of behaviour on YouTube.

This again highlights the difference in harm and risk profiles between YouTube and traditional social media services, and supports why YouTube should be treated differently under the SMMA.

This is further reinforced by the findings of a 2024 Harris poll which asked a representative sample of US Gen Z adults, for various platforms and products, if they wished that it "was never invented." YouTube had the lowest level of regret at 15 percent, lower than Netflix (17 percent), the internet itself (17 percent), messaging apps (19 percent) and the smartphone (21 percent). This is compared to nearly half for TikTok (47%), Snapchat (43%), and X (formerly Twitter, 50%). The Harris poll notes, "we interpret these low numbers as indicating that Gen Z does not heavily regret the basic communication, storytelling and information-seeking functions of the internet".

## **3.2.** Alleged similarity of YouTube features and functions to other online services

Features and functionalities such as infinite scroll, autoplay, short-form video, recommendation systems and social metrics (such as likes, subscriber and comment) are ubiquitous across digital services. For example, recommendation systems are used in a variety of contexts including video-streaming services (e.g. Netflix), food-delivery services or apps or ecommerce sites. Social metrics such as "comments" and "likes" are also employed by the same type of services to help inform viewer or user preferences.

Given their broad use, an argument that these features and functionalities are inherently harmful is difficult to sustain. For example, recommendation systems are harmful only if they are used to amplify harmful content. YouTube sets a high baseline of safety through enforcement of its content policies and uses its recommendation systems to help mitigate and reduce the risk of user exposure to harmful content, to amplify high quality kids content consistent with principles developed with third party experts, and to limit repeated recommendation of certain categories of content to u18 account holders.

Suggesting that their use is inherently harmful or makes a platform 'social' does not take into account distinctions between services and how individual services may implement or leverage these features. The SMMA regulates access to social media services which, taken holistically, are considered harmful for younger users.

Many of the features identified by eSafety as potentially *increasing* the risk of harm on YouTube are either not available or are subject to additional controls or interventions for users under 18:

- Autoplay: For both under 18 and pre-teen supervised experiences, auto-play is off by default.
- **Comments:** In addition to the points raised at 2.2 above, comments are turned off for all made for kids content. For pre-teen supervised experiences, parents can control whether their child can

read and/or write based on the experience selected. Stricter comments filtering is also applied - for example, comments with links to third party sites (which are not under YouTube's control) are not shown, and finally, to help supervised experience users begin to navigate the comments experience on YouTube, we are surfacing context cards to Supervised Experience users. These cards serve as reminders that comments are opinions, and point users towards best practices for dialogue on digital platforms.

• **Recommendations:** For both under 18 and pre-teen supervised experiences, additional protections are applied to reduce the harm that may be caused by repetitive video sequencing. For example, content that compares body shapes or fitness levels.

## Attachment A - Features and Functionalities of Under 18 and Pre-Teen Supervised Experiences Accounts

	U 18 Accounts	Pre-Teen Supervised Experiences		
Content	No access to age-restricted content	No access to age-restricted content		
	Additional age assurance step where users may be asked to provide additional proof of age when attending to watch mature content on YouTube if our	Parents can further restrict the content their child sees by choosing one of three content settings:		
	systems are unable to establish that they are over 18.	Explore - generally aligns with content rating for viewers 9+		
		Explore More - generally aligns with content ratings for viewers 13+		
		Most of YT - Almost all videos on YouTube except for content marked as 18+ and other videos that may not be appropriate for viewers using supervised experiences		
Recommendations	Safeguards on video sequencing for content that is okay a single or few views, but could become problematic for some if viewed in repetition:			
	<ul> <li>compares physical features and idealizes some types over others, such as a beauty routine to slim down your nose to look prettier</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>idealizes specific fitness levels or body weights, such as an exercise routine that encourages pursuit of an idealized appearance</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>features real-world social aggression, such as encouraging physical intimidation in confrontational interactions</li> <li>features unrealistic or bad financial advice that takes advantage of the low financial literacy of teens. This includes content featuring, for example, 'get rich quick' schemes, or suggesting viewers should buy a particular product that teaches you to get rich or buy lottery tickets to get rich.</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>portrays delinquency or negative behaviors, such as cheating on a test, lying for personal benefit or participating in public pranks and stunts that negatively impact others e.g. offending customers in a store while pretending to work there.</li> <li>portray teens as cruel and malicious or encourages them to ridicule others, such as targeting harassing people in public</li> </ul>			
	who say they want to be left alone, or making fun of others for being poor.			

Autoplay	Off by default	Off by default
		Parents can also disable through Family Link.
Comments	Subject to YouTube's Community Guidelines	Linked to the content setting parents chose for their children.  Explore - disabled (read and write)  Explore More - disabled (write)  Most of YT - disabled (write)
		<ul> <li>Stricter comment filters - filtering out:         <ul> <li>Low quality comments (including comments that include moderate to heavy profanity; lewd, vulgar, sexualizing, or pornographic language; bullying; or harmful and dangerous content.</li> <li>Links to third-party websites, since we do not have the ability/authority to control the content that third parties post on their own sites; and</li> <li>All comments from channels whose content is marked as 18+ or otherwise may not be appropriate for viewers using supervised experiences.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Comments sorted by 'Top Comments' to ensure younger uses see the highest quality age-appropriate comments. Cannot be changed.</li> </ul>
		Context cards to remind users that comments are opinions and point them towards best practices
Upload	Private by default	Disabled
	Restrict <u>sensitive ad categories</u> (such as tobacco and alcohol, gambling, weight loss, and shocking content for	Personalised ads prohibited Restrict sensitive ad categories (such as tobacco and alcohol, gambling, weight loss, and shocking content for minors).
	Hilliors)	Prohibition of ads in additional categories (beauty and fitness, foods and beverages, religion, or politics, as well as ads with inappropriate content

-	40	
	()	
	$\leq$	
ı	=	
	$\subseteq$	
	$\succeq$	
	$\cup$	
1	1	
V		
	=	
L		
	(1)	
	ت	
	76	
	U)	
1		
	$\overline{}$	
	4	
	(1)	
	$\equiv$	
Ξ		
		7
_		
	\ I	
	N	
	N.	
	N. 00	
	N. 000	
	(C)	
	1 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 3 2 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3	
	Ct 1882	
	1000 X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X	
	ACT 1982	
	ACT 1982	
	ACT 1982	
	MCt 1982	
	J ACT 1982	
	A O	
	FO Act 1982	
	TO A	
	TO A	
	De FOLA	
	De FOLA	
	TO A	
	the FOLA	
	r the FO A	
	r the FO A	
	er the FOLA	
	er the FOLA	
	er the FOLA	
	nder the FOLA	
	nder the FOLA	
	nder the FOLA	
- () L	inder the FOLA	
()()()()()()()()()()()()()()()()()()()	under the FOLA	
- ( ) ( ) ( ) - ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( )	inder the FOLA	
- ( ) ( ) ( ) - ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( )	d under the FOLA	
(((())))	under the FOLA	
((()())) < -(()L	sed under the FOLA	
( ( ( L )	d under the FOLA	
- (() L	ised under the FOLA	
- ((L)	sed under the FOLA	

		such as scary imagery, crude humor, or sexual innuendo)
Digital wellbeing tools	On by default.	
	Take a Break Reminders (every 60 mins) and Bedtime Reminders (10 pm) and appear as full screen takeovers across YouTube Short and long form videos.	





Google Australia Pty Ltd Level 5, 48 Pirrama Road Pyrmont NSW 2009 Tel: 02 9374-4000 Fax: 02 9374-4001 www.youtube.com

24 July 2025

The Hon Anika Wells MP
Minister for Communications
Parliament House
CANBERRA ACT 2600

#### BY EMAIL

Dear Minister.

Further to your meeting with YouTube's CEO, Neal Mohan, and consistent with our intention to engage constructively, the purpose of this letter to is provide transparency around our understanding of the options available to us as the Government contemplates specified exclusions under Part 4A (Social Media Minimum Age) of the *Online Safety Act 2021* (Cth) (**OSA**).

## Options being considered where no express YouTube exclusion

Given the Government is now considering resiling from previous representations concerning its intention to ensure YouTube be excluded from Part 4A of the OSA, YouTube is considering its legal position as to the application and operation of Part 4A including:

- 1) challenging the restrictions on constitutional grounds, and/or
- seeking a Declaration that the law does not apply to YouTube, and/or
- 3) challenging the Government's reversal of its decision to expressly exclude YouTube.

Of course, it would not be necessary to consider these matters further if YouTube were to be expressly specified as excluded.

 Part 4A is invalid as an impermissible fetter on the implied Constitutional freedom of political communication

YouTube considers there is a real question as to whether Part 4A of the OSA is invalid as an impermissible fetter on the implied constitutional freedom of political communication, particularly in its application to YouTube.

The effect of Part 4A would be to impose a burden on political communication, by restricting the ability of young adults (under 16 years of age) to have a YouTube account and therefore to contribute to political communication by posting videos on YouTube and by making comments on those videos. Further, the application of Part 4A to YouTube appears to be neither suitable nor proportionate to achieving the stated purpose of Part 4A to reduce harm to children and young adults. The application of Part 4A to YouTube will not achieve this aim (because children and young adults will still be able to watch videos on YouTube, without an account), and indeed will be deleterious to this aim (because the targeted safety features that apply to the accounts of children and young adults will no longer apply).

The minimum age obligation in s63D does not apply to YouTube

YouTube considers there is a real question as to whether it is an "age-restricted social media platform" as defined in OSA s 63C(1)(a), to which the minimum age obligation in s 63D applies. That is because YouTube is not a social media platform. Rather, YouTube is a video streaming platform that enables users to access video content. Video content is disseminated on a one-to-many basis. Any limited social features that are available on YouTube (such as the ability to comment on videos) are ancillary to this purpose.

3) Reversal of the Government's decision

Given the legislation was passed on the express understanding that YouTube would be excluded, there is real doubt as to whether the removal of that exclusion is an appropriate exercise of the Minister's power.

To the extent that the Minister may be purporting to rely on the eSafety Commissioner's advice as a basis for its change, we do not consider this can form a sufficient or proper basis for the change in position. First, we reject the robustness of the advice, and second, nothing in the advice is contrary to the matters taken into consideration by the then Government in taking its original policy decision.

## The social media minimum age requirement should not apply to YouTube

Regardless of its legal options, YouTube remains of the view that there are strong policy reasons for the Government's decision to exclude YouTube from the social media minimum age requirement.

This position is overwhelmingly supported by the detailed facts concerning YouTube previously provided to you and your predecessor. Consistent with these facts, the Commonwealth has, until very recently, through a series of express representations and public statements upon which YouTube has relied, endorsed and adopted the position that YouTube ought to be exempt. A summary of that relevant background follows.

When the Online Safety Amendment (Social Media Minimum Age) Bill 2024 (Cth) (Bill) was brought before Parliament, the Commonwealth Government confirmed its intention for legislative rules to be made to specify YouTube as not being an "age-restricted social media platform" such that it would be exempt from the minimum age requirements. As part of her Second Reading Speech to Parliament in respect of the Bill, the then Communications Minister (the Hon Michelle Rowland MP), made a number of statements as to the intended purpose of relevant rule making powers, stating:

"The rule will provide for an 'out of scope' status to also be applied to services like...YouTube, and other apps that can be shown to function like social media in their interactivity but operate with a significant purpose to enable young people to get the education and health support they need."

On 21 November 2024, in a press release regarding the Bill, the Prime Minister stated:

"The Bill and the associated rules will ensure young Australians have continued access to messaging and online gaming, as well as access to services which are health and education related, like Headspace, Kids Helpline, and Google Classroom, and YouTube."

On 29 November 2024, the Bill passed Parliament. The Prime Minister issued a further press release stating that the Bill would enable continued access to YouTube.

On 9 December 2024, Minister Rowland confirmed by letter to Mr Mohan that YouTube would be excluded from social media minimum age obligations, and this would remain the position of a re-elected Labor Government. The Minister stated.

"..the Government made a commitment to exclude YouTube from the definition of an age-restricted service.

I am writing to reaffirm the commitment that a re-elected Labor Government would give effect to this definitional exclusion for YouTube video streaming services, including YouTube Kids."

On or about 28 February 2025, the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sports and the Arts circulated an exposure draft of the *Online Safety (Age Restricted Social Media Platforms) Rules 2025* (**Draft Rules**). Consistent with the position, the Draft Rules specified YouTube pursuant to OSA s 63C(6)(b) (thereby excluding YouTube from the operation of the social media minimum age requirement imposed by OSA s 63D).

Until very recently, the Government's unambiguous and publicly stated intention has been to exclude YouTube from the minimum age obligations on the basis that it has an obvious policy basis.

YouTube now understands you may now be considering not expressly specifying YouTube's exclusion from the minimum age obligations. This is despite the clear policy position already taken, and despite no changes being made to YouTube's product offering.

This is obviously a matter of grave concern to YouTube.

## Procedural fairness requirements have not been met

YouTube maintains that you should specify YouTube pursuant to OSA s 63C(6)(b). Without admission as to whether YouTube is an "age-restricted social media platform", YouTube seeks this specification, for the avoidance of doubt as to whether the social media minimum age requirement applies to YouTube.

While it now appears the Government is considering resiling from its previous representations that YouTube would be excluded from the social media minimum age obligations, YouTube is unaware of the basis on which the Government is considering a change in its position.

In those circumstances, and consistent with the principles of procedural fairness, YouTube seeks to (i) be informed of any matters on which the Minister proposes to rely in deciding not to exempt YouTube and (ii) be given the opportunity to respond to those concerns.

## **Next steps**

YouTube should be specified as excluded from Part 4A of the OSA, consistent with the Government's previous representations and for the same reasons that the previous representations were made.

If the Government is considering not excluding YouTube, then YouTube seeks an opportunity to provide further submissions before any such decision is made.

If ultimately no exclusion is expressly provided, then YouTube contemplates having to engage with the options available to it.

Yours faithfully,

s 47F

s 47F

Head of Government Affairs and Public Policy YouTube, Australia and New Zealand

s 47F

s 47F

Director of Legal Google, Australia and New Zealand

Meeting with \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) from Google [SEC=OFFICIAL] M1.19; \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) Subject:

**Location:** 

Tue 29/07/2025 1:00 PM Start: Tue 29/07/2025 1:30 PM End:

**Recurrence:** (none)

**Meeting Status:** Accepted

**Organizer:** 

**Required Attendees:** 

**Resources:** 

**OFFICIAL** 

 From:
 \$ 47F
 @google.com>

 Sent:
 Tuesday, 29 July 2025 10:17 AM

To: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii)

**Subject:** Re: Congratulations from Google Australia [SEC=OFFICIAL]

You don't often get email from \$ 47F @google.com. Learn why this is important

Thanks s 22(1)(a)(ii) much appreciated.

I am just trying to finalise 47F meetings for Thursday morning, will come back to you ahead of Thurs to let you know in advance if we need 47F to be signed in.

best regards



On Tue, 29 Jul 2025 at 09:00, Is 22(1)(a)(ii) mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

Thanks for this \$47F see you at 10.30am Thursday morning.

Please do let me know if you need an escort through the building to the Ministerial Wing and I can collect you.

Kind Regards,



Office Manager • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP

Minister for Communications • Minister for Sport • Member for Lilley

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au • s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Suite M1.19, Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS • ENRICHING COMMUNITIES • EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au







I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

## **OFFICIAL**

From: s 47F <s 47F @google.com>

**Sent:** Friday, 25 July 2025 7:32 PM

To: \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>
Cc: \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>
Subject: Re: Congratulations from Google Australia [SEC=OFFICIAL]

Thanks so much

We can make this work - it will at least be me with \$475 but will let you know on Monday if we will have any of our other team members joining us.

Have a great weekend!

best regards

s 47F

On Fri, 25 Jul 2025 at 14:57, s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

Hi s 47F

We have landed at 10.30am on the Thursday morning at the Ministers suite M1.19 in Parliament House Ministerial Wing.

This will be the only time available to meet in the Minister's schedule this coming week.

Hopefully this is suitable for \$47F and the team, the Google event in the great hall is in the diary as well and the Minister will drop in if she can make it in the evening.

Do you know who will be attending this meeting with \$47F so that I can add that to the information?

Kind Regards,

## s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Office Manager • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP

Minister for Communications • Minister for Sport • Member for Lilley

Suite M1.19, Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS • ENRICHING COMMUNITIES • EMPOWERING REGIONS





I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live.

I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

#### **OFFICIAL**

From: \$ 47F @google.com>

Sent: Thursday, 24 July 2025 9:31 PM

To: \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Congratulations from Google Australia [SEC=OFFICIAL]

Thank you!!

has some flexibility in the morning probably up until around 1pm, but after that she's got meetings locked in (and will have to be available for some pre-event activities for our Google at Parliament House event Wed night...hope you can join us, it is in the Great Hall from 5.30!).

Let me know whether that window till lunchtime Wed might work - I understand will be in Canberra from about 9ish in the morning, flights permitting.

best regards



On Thu, 24 Jul 2025 at 17:32, s 22(1)(a)(ii) mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

Hi s 47F

I haven't forgotten you I promise!

It's all a bit in flux at this stage so we are hoping to have a meeting tomorrow to nail down if things need to be moved about a bit.

Would safe have any other time slots on Wednesday at all? Just so I have options to go to the meeting with?

Kind Regards,

## s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Office Manager • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP

Minister for Communications • Minister for Sport • Member for Lilley

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au • s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Suite M1.19, Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

## Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS • ENRICHING COMMUNITIES • EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au



I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live.

I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

### **OFFICIAL**

From: \$ 47F @google.com>

Sent: Thursday, 24 July 2025 2:53 PM

To: \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Congratulations from Google Australia [SEC=OFFICIAL]

You don't often get email from \$ 47F @google.com. Learn why this is important

⊣ i s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Just following up on the below - please let me know if the time still works or if there is an alternative to suggest.

best regards



On Tue, 22 Jul 2025 at 14:18, **S 47F** @google.com> wrote:

⊟j s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Sorry for the late reply, I just wanted to double check with \$47F team that we could make this time work. Pleased to advise we can, so it will be \$47F and myself attending the meeting.

While I have a pass, we're likely to need safe to be signed in, so if possible, we'll arrive a little early and call the office to arrange for safe to get signed in.

Please let me know if you need anything else at this time.

best regards



On Mon, 21 Jul 2025 at 17:29, \$ 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au> wrote:

**OFFICIAL** 

Hi **s 47**F

Minister Wells is available to meet with \$ 47F here in her offices at Parliament House at 10am on 31 July 2025.

Please let me know if this is suitable and I will add it to the Minister's diary.

Kind Regards,



Office Manager • Office of the Hon Anika Wells MP

Minister for Communications • Minister for Sport • Member for Lilley

s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au • s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Suite M1.19, Parliament House, Canberra ACT 2600, Australia

Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications, Sport and the Arts CONNECTING AUSTRALIANS • ENRICHING COMMUNITIES • EMPOWERING REGIONS

infrastructure.gov.au



I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of this land on which we meet, work and live.

I recognise and respect their continuing connection to the land, waters and communities.

I pay my respects to Elders past and present and to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders.

### **OFFICIAL**

From: \$ 47F @google.com>
Sent: Monday, 7 July 2025 10:34 AM

To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @mo.communications.gov.au>

Subject: Fwd: Congratulations from Google Australia

You don't often get email from <u>\$ 47F</u> @google.com. <u>Learn why this is important</u> Good morning

I just wanted to follow up on the attached letter with a request for \$47F\$ to meet with Minister Wells. While I appreciate we've got a number of touchpoints on a range of issues with the office, we would be keen for \$47F\$ to meet with the Minister in the next couple of weeks. \$47F\$ will be in Canberra on 30 and 31 July if that might be an option, or we'd be happy to discuss options for a meeting in Brisbane or by video conference.

best regards



----- Forwarded message ------

From: \$ 47F @google.com>

Date: Fri, 16 May 2025 at 16:33

Subject: Congratulations from Google Australia

To: < 5 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au>

Cc: <s 22(1)(a)(ii) @aph.gov.au>, \$ 47F @google.com>, \$ 47F @google.com>

Good afternoon,

Please find attached a letter from \$47F, Managing Director and VP for Google Australia, to Minister Wells.

In relation to the meeting request, please feel free to reach out to \$47F or \$47F (cc'd) to find a time that's convenient for you.

We look forward to working with you. Regards, Government Affairs and Public Policy Google Australia @google.com

> Read the latest Google and YouTube reports See what's trending in Australia today

## Disclaimer

This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.

Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe penalties.

If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on § 22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copies of this transmission together with any attachments.

## Disclaimer

This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.

Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe penalties.

If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on \$22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copies of this transmission together with any attachments.

#### Disclaimer

This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.

Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe penalties.

If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on \$22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copies of this transmission together with any attachments.

-----

#### Disclaimer

This message has been issued by the Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development, Communications and the Arts. The information transmitted is for the use of the intended recipient only and may contain confidential and/or legally privileged material.

Any review, re-transmission, disclosure, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited and may result in severe penalties.

If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the Department on s 22(1)(a)(ii) and delete all copies of this transmission together with any attachments.

-----